

**Minutes  
Draft Minutes  
Faculty Senate Meeting  
5:00 PM, December 6th, 2005  
Mountain Con Room, SUB**

*Minutes submitted by secretary A. Stierle*

*Members present: Chair Grant Mitman, John Brower, Rod James, Bruce Madigan, Karen Porter, Mark Sholes, Susan Leland, Miriam Young and Secretary - Andrea Stierle*

*Member absent: Paul Conrad,*

*In attendance: Chancellor Gilmore, Vice Chancellor Patton*

- 1. approval of minutes-November 8<sup>th</sup> meeting**
- 2. Student evaluation of teaching**
- 3. General faculty meeting report**
- 4. Other**

**1. Minutes from November 8<sup>th</sup> meeting.**

Minutes from the November 8<sup>th</sup> meeting were approved and have been posted to the Faculty Senate posting. Grant Mitman will also append the minutes to the Faculty Senate website.

**2. Pay Raises for President and Chancellors**

Faculty member John Ray emailed the following to Senate members, and as it was the basis for the ensuing discussion it is included in the minutes as part of the record.

**From:** Ray, John

**Sent:** Tuesday, December 06, 2005 12:30 PM

**To:** Ray, John; Stierle, Andrea

**Cc:** Madigan, Bruce; Mitman, Grant (internal); Brower, John; Porter, Karen; Sholes, Mark; Young, Miriam; Conrad, Paul; James, Rod; Leland, Susan

**Subject:** RE: Faculty Senate minutes

**Importance:** High

*Given that I have another commitment and given Grant's point reproduced below, I will make the motion via email which is allowed under Robert's Rules of Order which I believe is the governing authority for the Faculty Senate. It is also allowed under Sturgis.*

Therefore, as a member of the Montana Tech Faculty, I would hereby move that the faculty senate adopt a resolution objecting to the latest administrative raises given by the Board of Regents to Presidents, Chancellors and the Commissioner of Higher Education. The resolution would read: "Given the following--That:

1. Since 1992 tuition and fees for Montana University and college students have tripled.
2. The annual survey of the National Center for Public Policy and Higher Education gives Montana higher education a D- grade for being affordable.
3. The Lumina Foundation for Education has determined that middle and low-income students can't afford most of Montana colleges and Universities even when they get loans.
4. Tuition will increase an average of approximately 19% for four-year college students in the next two years. (MEA-MFT)
5. Montana makes the smallest contribution per student in the nation.
6. Average annual pay in Montana is second from the bottom in the United States. Only Puerto Rico is lower. (Montana Department of Labor and Industry) According to the U.S. Department of Labor, average annual wages in Montana are \$26,000 per year. Montana has the lowest weekly wage in the continental United States of \$400. (Bureau of Labor Statistics.)
7. Montana is fourth from the top/highest ranking in multiple jobholders per family. Only Nebraska, North Dakota and Hawaii are higher. About 10% of Montana workers have to hold down two or more jobs to make ends meet. (Montana Department of Labor and Industry)
8. 20 percent of Montanans lack health insurance.
9. 21 percent of Montana children are below the poverty line. About 16% of Montanans are in working poor families.

***The Faculty Senate strongly objects to the latest administrative raises given by the Montana University System Board of Regents to Presidents, Chancellors and the Commission of Higher Education and asks the Regents to suspend and hold in abeyance these raises."***

***Professor John W. Ray***

John's email elicited much discussion. Grant commented that at the BOR meeting the Faculty Senate MUSFAR agreed unanimously to the pay raises for the Commissioner of Higher Education, Presidents, Chancellors, and COT Deans (Great Falls and Helena) of the University system. The appropriate minutes from the BOR have been added to the minutes below.\*

Much discussion ensued on this issue. Senators were not opposed to pay raises for administrators – only the magnitude of the pay raises.

Major concerns included:

1. **What problem are we fixing? We don't have problems attracting CEO's and there is not a problem with rapid turnover. Why are such substantial raises justified?**
2. **These raises will ultimately be passed on to students as further tuition increases.**
3. **How will Montana Tech pay for this increase without additional allocation of funds in a non-legislative year?**

For all of the schools these raises were coming without a legislative session to allocate funds for what will amount to \$30,000 - \$40,000 pay increases for the academic CEO's. The money will come from the campus budget at a time when we are already facing serious shortfalls.

Chancellor Gilmore commented that if the CHE and the Presidents agree that funds are not available in October 2006 for such a substantial pay raise, the raise may be deferred to October 2007. Chancellor Gilmore said that he had sent to President Dennison a request to defer his raise until 2007. He was waiting for word from Dennison and would let us know what the final decision is relative to the deferral.

**Regent Mercer MOVED to rescind the item approved at the September, 2005 meeting and to take up item d. as an entirely new proposal.**

 **Motion APPROVED** unanimously on 7-0 vote.

***Regent Semmens reviewed the purpose of the action in September. In consideration of internal equity, he was asking to lower the percentage of the average for Presidential compensation from 100% to 90%. This item will also allow for a variation in pay for the Chancellors, with a band of 75% to 90% of the Presidential pay. This would be decided by the Presidents based on time, responsibility, and other standard factors. Also included in this item is the inclusion of the Deans of the two stand-alone colleges of technology. The Committee recommended adding Section 5. to the Policy with the following language: 5. If the CHE and the President, in consultation with the CEO of a given campus, determine that there are insufficient financial resources at the campus or office to fully implement this item for the year beginning October 2007, they may agree to defer it to October 2008.***

***The motion was made to discuss CEO pay raises with the General Faculty.***

The motion was made and seconded, and passed 5 to 4.

### **3. Student Evaluation of Teaching Form**

The Senate discussed the outcome of the Faculty Forum on the current Student Evaluation of Teaching Form (SETF). The Discussion Board forum concerning the

student evaluation of teaching form ended in a tie – of the faculty members who responded 13 are satisfied with the form, 13 are not satisfied. A few faculty posted comments along with their votes. These concerns are generally focused on how the evaluations can be misused. There is concern that the administration is moving towards a “no child left behind” policy – each and every student in the class must like the instructor and the instructor’s approach to teaching. This includes students who never attend class, and students who put little or no energy into a class and earn a D or F. This is not reasonable. Assessment is important, but if 80-80% of the students approve of an instructor and 10 % do not, is that truly ineffective teaching. Many of the students who write negative evaluations may be reflecting their own frustration at not being prepared for the college experience, not having understood the prerequisites for a given class, or simply not wanting to work at a given subject. Even good instructors fail to reach certain students.

Another concern voiced by faculty members is the disparate use of evaluations by the administration. Some faculty members believe that a few negative evaluations are used as grounds for denial of promotion/tenure even if their overall evaluation portfolio is strong.

Senators were encouraged to read material about evaluations before the next meeting to be able to address the next step in the process.

*Meeting adjourned at 6:05 PM.*

\* *From November BOR minutes:*  
**ITEM 129-108-R1109**

**Proposed Policy  
Amendments Setting Salaries  
for the Commissioner of  
Higher Education, Presidents,  
Chancellors, and Deans of the  
stand-alone Colleges of  
Technology (in Helena and  
Great Falls)**

**THAT:**

The Board of Regents adopts the attached amendments to **ITEM 128-114-R0905**, which the Board adopted September 23, 2005, to set forth a method for determining salaries for the commissioner of higher education, presidents, and chancellors.

**BACKGROUND:**

The State of Montana sets salary levels for chief elected officials and district judges at 100% of the average for

comparable positions in Montana, North Dakota, South Dakota, Wyoming, and Idaho. The Board of Regents in September 2005 voted to adopt the same methodology for setting the salaries of the Presidents of the University of Montana (UM) and Montana State University (MSU), with a related formula for setting certain other executive salaries in the University System.

The best available data as of November 1, 2005 indicates that the Presidents at UM and MSU earn approximately 70% of the five-state average regional presidential salary (including Montana). CUPA data indicates that faculty members in Bozeman and Missoula earn approximately 98% and 99%, respectively, of the five-state regional average faculty salary. A recent salary survey by the Commissioner's Office indicates that UM and MSU vice presidents earn, on average, approximately 90% of their peers in the five-state region. Labor statistics indicate that Montana's per capita income is approximately 93% of the five-state average per capita income.

The accompanying policy amendment maintains the formulaic approach of the policy adopted in September, but includes three substantive revisions:

1. Instead of establishing pay for the UM and MSU Presidents at 100% of the average regional presidential pay (using the universities in North Dakota, South Dakota, Wyoming, Idaho and Montana), the policy establishes the pay at 90% of the regional average. The reason for this percentage is twofold: (i) sensitivity to

internal pay equity within the Montana University System; and (ii) sensitivity to market compensation levels within Montana generally.

2. The amendment proposes to continue the current practice by which the Regents directly establish the salary levels of only the Presidents and the Commissioner. Under the policy amendment, the Presidents of UM and MSU would continue to establish the individual salary levels of the Chancellors who report to them, with consideration given to relative responsibilities, performance, market considerations, and service to the University System. The policy does, however, provide for an acceptable range of salary levels, expressed as a percentage of the salaries of the Presidents, and further provides that any salary is subject to Regents' approval.

3. The amendment extends the policy to all campus CEOs, including the Deans of the Great Falls and Helena Colleges of Technology, with a lower range of compensation for those executives to reflect current relative compensation levels.

The amendment also includes some technical clarifications, including the use of an annual (rather than biennial) salary survey, and an effectiveness date of October 1 (rather than July 1) to coincide with the effectiveness date for salary changes of other employees serving under Board of Regents contracts.

**ITEM 129-108-R1105 would amend ITEM 128-114-R0905 in the following manner:**

SUBJECT: PERSONNEL

Section: 8xx.x Salaries of the Commissioner of Higher Education **and Campus Chief Executive Officers**, ~~Presidents and Chancellors~~

---

Board policy:

1. Prior to November 1, 2005, the Commissioner of Higher Education shall conduct a salary survey of the presidents of the following institutions of higher education: the University of Idaho, Idaho State University, the University of Wyoming, the University of North Dakota, North Dakota State University, the University of South Dakota and South Dakota State University. The Commissioner shall include the salaries of the presidents of the University of Montana (**UM**) and Montana State University (**MSU**) in determining the average regional presidential salary.

2. Effective July ~~October~~ 1, 2006, the salaries of the Commissioner of Higher Education, **the UM and MSU Presidents, the and Chancellors, and the Deans of the Great Falls and Helena Colleges of Technology will be established as follows:** ~~of the Montana University System will be set as follows:~~ The salaries ~~ies~~ of the Presidents of **UM and MSU** ~~The University of Montana and Montana State University will be~~ **90%** of the average **regional presidential** salary determined by means of the survey. The salary of the Commissioner of Higher Education will be 105% of the **salaries of the UM and MSU Presidents.** ~~presidents' salaries.~~ The **respective salaries** of the Chancellors **and the Deans of the Great Falls and Helena Colleges of Technology** will be ~~85% of the presidents' salaries.~~ **established on an individual basis at the discretion of the President of the affiliated university, in view of the President's assessment of relative responsibilities, performance, market factors, and service with the University System, subject to Board of Regents approval. The salaries of the Chancellors will be established within a range of 75% to 90% of the salaries of the UM and MSU Presidents. The salaries of the Deans of the Great Falls and Helena Colleges of Technology will be established within a range of 60% to 75% of the salaries of the UM and MSU Presidents.**

3. Thereafter, prior to June ~~September~~ 30 of each even-~~numbered~~ year, the Commissioner **of Higher Education** shall conduct a similar survey by which to set the salaries of the Commissioner of Higher Education **and the Presidents of UM and MSU, effective October 1**, ~~presidents and chancellors.~~ Beginning July 1 of the year following the year in which the survey is conducted, ~~the salaries of the commissioner, presidents and chancellors will be set in accordance with the formula set in subsection 2 of this policy, using the most recent salary survey information.~~ **Prior to each October 1, the Presidents shall establish the salaries of the Chancellors and the Deans of the Great Falls and Helena Colleges of**

**Technology within the ranges provided for in paragraph 2, subject to Board of Regents approval.**

**4. An intent of this policy is to establish the salaries of the chief executive officers of the Montana University System and its campuses with consideration for external market competitiveness and internal pay equity within the System.**

**For ease of readability, an unmarked version of the proposed policy as amended above is included here:**

SUBJECT: PERSONNEL

Section: 8xx.x Salaries of the Commissioner of Higher Education and Campus Chief Executive Officers

---

Board policy:

1. Prior to November 1, 2005, the Commissioner of Higher Education shall conduct a salary survey of the presidents of the following institutions of higher education: the University of Idaho, Idaho State University, the University of Wyoming, the University of North Dakota, North Dakota State University, the University of South Dakota and South Dakota State University. The Commissioner shall include the salaries of the presidents of the University of Montana (UM) and Montana State University (MSU) in determining the average regional presidential salary.
2. Effective October 1, 2006, the salaries of the Commissioner of Higher Education, the UM and MSU Presidents, the Chancellors, and the Deans of the Great Falls and Helena Colleges of Technology will be established as follows: The salaries of the Presidents of UM and MSU will be 90% of the average regional presidential salary determined by means of the survey. The salary of the Commissioner of Higher Education will be 105% of the salaries of the UM and MSU Presidents. The respective salaries of the Chancellors and the Deans of the Great Falls and Helena Colleges of Technology will be established on an individual basis at the discretion of the President of the affiliated university, in view of the President's assessment of relative responsibilities, performance, market factors, and service with the University System, subject to Board of Regents approval. The salaries of the Chancellors will be established within a range of 75% to 90% of the salaries of the UM and MSU Presidents. The salaries of the Deans of the Great Falls and Helena Colleges of Technology will be established within a range of 60% to 75% of the salaries of the UM and MSU Presidents.
3. Thereafter, prior to September 30 of each year, the Commissioner of Higher Education shall conduct a similar survey by which to set the salaries of the Commissioner of Higher



Education and the Presidents of UM and MSU, effective October 1 of the year following the year in which the survey is conducted. Prior to each October 1, the Presidents shall establish the salaries of the Chancellors and the Deans of the Great Falls and Helena Colleges of Technology within the ranges provided for in paragraph 2, subject to Board of Regents approval.

4. An intent of this policy is to establish the salaries of the chief executive officers of the Montana University System and its campuses with consideration for external market competitiveness and internal pay equity within the system.